

# T Transportation Committee

Meeting date: August 25, 2008

## ADVISORY INFORMATION

**Date:** August 18, 2008  
**Subject:** Authorization to Reject All Proposals for Northstar Maintenance Services  
**District(s), Member(s):** All  
**Policy/Legal Reference:** Council Policy 3-3 Expenditures  
**Staff Prepared/Presented:** Brian Lamb, General Manager 612-349-7510  
Vince Pellegrin, Chief Operating Officer 612-349-7511  
Ed Byers, Senior Manager, Northstar 612-341-5642  
Chris Gran, Director of Purchasing 612-349-5060  
**Division/Department:** Metro Transit

### Proposed Action

That the Metropolitan Council reject all proposals for Northstar Commuter Rail Line Maintenance Services (RFP Number 08P018) and that Council staff be directed to perform the work described in the Request for Proposals.

### Background

In preparation for the start of Northstar Commuter Rail services scheduled for November 2009, the Council solicited proposals to provide maintenance services related to rolling stock (locomotives and coach cars), yard track and switches, the Big Lake Vehicle Maintenance Facility and the Big Lake station. Services were to be provided for a total of six years, including a one-year startup period and five years of revenue operation.

A Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued by the Council in March 2008. Four proposals were received, from Alstom Transportation, Inc., Bombardier Mass Transit Corporation, MotivePower, Inc., and Protrans Northstar LLC. An Evaluation Panel, with members representing the Council and the Northstar Corridor Development Authority, evaluated the four proposals. The Evaluation Panel selected three firms as finalists and conducted discussions with each of the finalists to clarify issues in their proposals. Best and Final Offers (BAFOs) were requested from the three proposers.

The Evaluation Panel evaluated the BAFOs, and the consensus evaluation results are summarized below.

<b>Proposer</b>	<b>BAFO Rating</b>	<b>BAFO Cost</b>
Protrans Northstar	Very Good	\$41,573,049
Bombardier	Good	\$38,969,424
MotivePower	Marginal	\$34,280,466

The BAFOs submitted by Protrans Northstar and Bombardier complied with Council requirements and contained relatively minor technical changes to the original proposals. The BAFO submitted by MotivePower failed to comply with a number of Council requirements, and inclusion of these requirements would increase the MotivePower cost by between \$2-3 million.

Prior to the receipt of BAFOs, the Evaluation Panel reviewed a cost estimate prepared by Metro Transit to perform the work described in the RFP. The Metro Transit cost estimate to perform all the services detailed in the scope of the RFP is \$30,955,918, substantially less than the BAFO cost proposals.

**Rationale**

Based on its evaluation of proposals and a review of the Metro Transit cost estimate, the Evaluation Panel unanimously concludes that all cost proposals submitted far exceeds the Metro Transit cost estimate, that the work described in the RFP can be performed by Council staff at a significant cost savings, and that it is in the best interest of the Council to reject all proposals and perform the work with Council staff.

The Evaluation Panel unanimously recommends that the Council reject all proposals and that Council staff be directed to perform the work described in the RFP.

**Funding**

Funding for Northstar Commuter Rail Line maintenance services is expected to come from stakeholders and the Council.

**Known Support / Opposition**

No known opposition.